

09:30:56

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ORIGINAL

-----x
SABINA PARADI, a Judicially Declared
Incapacitated Person by the Guardians
of her Person and Property, BODO PARADY
and MARY MOORE,

Plaintiffs,
Civil Action No.
-against-
07 CIV 3640 (JCF)

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS,

Defendant.

-----x
August 21, 2007
9:47 a.m.

Videotape Deposition of MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS,
taken by Plaintiff, pursuant to Notice, at the
offices of DeCaro & Kaplen, 20 Vesey Street, New
York, New York, before William Visconti, a
Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public within and
for the State of New York.

1
2 APP E A R A N C E S:

3 DE CARO & KAPLEN
4 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
5 20 Vesey Street
6 New York, New York 10007

7 BY: MICHAEL V. KAPLEN, ESQ.

8 JAMES D. BUTLER, ESQ
9 Attorneys for Defendant
10 591 Summit Avenue
11 Jersey City, New Jersey 07306

12 ALSO PRESENT:

13 SARAH ENGELMAN, Videographer
14 SUSAN PHILLIPS

1

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED
by and between the attorneys for the
respective parties herein that filing and
sealing be and the same are hereby waived.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED
that all objections, except as to the form
of the question, shall be reserved to the
time of the trial.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED
that the within deposition may be signed
and sworn to before any officer authorized
to administer an oath with the same force
and effect as if signed and sworn to before
the Court.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

09:46:56 1

09:46:58 2

MR. KAPLEN: I just want the record

09:47:10 3

to reflect before we start that I had informed

09:47:14 4

Defendant's counsel that Sabina Paradi passed

09:47:20 5

away on June 30th, 2007 and that we have agreed

09:47:24 6

that although formal substitution has not taken

09:47:26 7

place and legal proceedings of California have

09:47:30 8

not taken place as of yet to substitute the

09:47:32 9

estate of Miss Paradi as party Plaintiff in this

09:47:38 10

action, we have agreed nonetheless to go forward

09:47:42 11

with the deposition of Defendant today to be used

09:47:46 12

as if all of that has formally taken place.

09:47:58 13

MR. BUTLER: That's correct.

09:48:02 14

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the video

09:48:04 15

operator speaking Sarah Engelman of Merrill Legal

09:48:10 16

Services, 25 West 45th Street, New York, New York

09:48:16 17

10037. Today is August 21, 2007 and the time is

09:48:20 18

9:47 a.m. We are at the offices of

09:48:22 19

DeCaro & Kaplen to take the videotape deposition

09:48:26 20

of Michael Phillips in the matter of Sabina

09:48:28 21

Paradi a judicially declared incapacitated person

09:48:34 22

by the guardians of her person and property, Bodo

09:48:38 23

Paradi and Mary Moore versus Michael R. Phillips

09:48:38 24

in the United States District Court Souther

25

District of New York. Will counsel introduce

09:48:40 1

09:48:40 2 themselves for the record.

09:48:44 3 MR. KAPLEN: Good morning, I'm

09:48:44 4 Michael Kaplen and I represent the Plaintiffs in

09:48:46 5 this case.

09:48:48 6 MR. BUTLER: James D. Butler on

09:48:50 7 behalf of the Defendant.

09:48:52 8 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Will the court

09:48:58 9 reporter, Bill Visconti, of Merrill Legal

10 Services swear the witness.

11

12 M I C H A E L R. P H I L L I P S,

13 having been first duly sworn by the Notary Public

14 (William Visconti), was examined and testified as

15 follows:

09:49:04 16 EXAMINATION CONDUCTED BY MR. KAPLEN:

09:49:04 17 Q. Good morning.

09:49:06 18 A. Good morning.

09:49:10 19 Q. Again, my name is Michael Kaplen and

09:49:12 20 I represent the late Sabina Paradi and her family

09:49:16 21 in connection with this case. I'm going to be

09:49:20 22 asking you questions today concerning an incident

09:49:22 23 that happened on February 25th of 2007 and if you

09:49:24 24 don't understand my questions please tell me and

25 we will rephrase those questions for you. Okay?

09:49:26 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:49:28 2

A. Okay.

09:49:28 3

Q. You understand that this is being

09:49:30 4

videotaped?

09:49:30 5

A. Yes.

09:49:32 6

Q. You understand please that your

09:49:32 7

answers have to be oral?

09:49:36 8

A. Yes.

09:49:38 9

Q. So we get it all down both by our

09:49:38 10

stenographer and as well as the video?

09:49:40 11

A. Yes.

09:49:40 12

Q. Can you tell us please where you
currently reside?

09:49:44 14

A. 2 Robin Road, Rumson, New Jersey.

09:49:46 15

Q. Is that a private residence?

09:49:46 16

A. Yes.

09:49:50 17

Q. Who did you reside there with?

09:49:52 18

A. My wife Susan and my son John.

09:49:54 19

Q. What is Susan's full name?

09:49:56 20

A. Susan Raquel Phillips.

09:49:58 21

Q. How long have you resided there?

09:49:58 22

A. I have been there for almost 20
years.

09:50:04 24

Q. Is this a one-family house?

25

A. Yes.

09:50:04 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:50:06 2

Q. Does anybody else reside there

09:50:06 3

besides the three of you?

09:50:10 4

A. No.

09:50:10 5

Q. And your wife, does she own a

09:50:12 6

vehicle?

09:50:14 7

A. Yes.

8

Q. Did she own a vehicle in February of

09:50:16 9

2007?

09:50:16 10

A. Yes.

09:50:18 11

Q. What type of vehicle was that that

09:50:20 12

she owned?

09:50:24 13

A. She owns a Dodge Caravan.

09:50:26 14

Q. In addition to that Dodge Caravan and

09:50:28 15

the vehicle that you were driving on the date of

09:50:32 16

this incident, which we will get to in a moment,

09:50:32 17

does anybody in that household own any other

09:50:34 18

vehicles?

09:50:36 19

A. Besides myself, no.

09:50:36 20

Q. And your wife?

09:50:38 21

A. Yes.

09:50:38 22

Q. Your son owns a vehicle?

09:50:40 23

A. No.

09:50:40 24

Q. So there is only two vehicles in the

25

house?

09:50:42 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:50:44 2

A. Yes.

09:50:46 3

Q. On February 25th of 2007 what type of

09:50:50 4

vehicle were you driving?

09:50:52 5

A. My '88 Chevrolet pickup.

09:50:54 6

Q. What year vehicle was that?

09:50:56 7

A. 1988.

09:50:56 8

Q. Does that vehicle have power

09:50:56 9

steering?

09:50:58 10

A. Yes.

09:50:58 11

Q. Power brakes?

09:51:00 12

A. Yes.

09:51:00 13

Q. Antilock brakes?

09:51:02 14

A. Yes.

09:51:04 15

Q. Automatic or manual transmission?

09:51:08 16

A. Manual.

09:51:12 17

Q. As a result of the incident that

09:51:14 18

happened on February 25th of 2007 was there any

09:51:14 19

damage to your vehicle?

09:51:22 20

A. No.

09:51:22 21

Q. No damage whatsoever to any portion

09:51:22 22

of the vehicle?

09:51:26 23

A. No, sir.

09:51:28 24

Q. Did you take your vehicle anyplace

25

for an inspection of any kind?

09:51:28 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:51:30 2

A. No.

09:51:32 3

Q. Do you know if your vehicle was

09:51:36 4

photographed?

09:51:38 5

A. I don't know .

09:51:42 6

MR. KAPLEN: Mr. Butler, do you have

09:51:44 7

the color photographs of this incident of the

09:51:46 8

truck involved in this incident?

09:51:48 9

MR. BUTLER: The vehicle was

09:51:52 10

photographed. I sent you all that I have which

09:51:56 11

are photocopies. I have arranged and I

09:51:58 12

anticipate getting within the next day or two the

09:52:02 13

color photo and which you have been trying and I

09:52:04 14

finally succeeded but I have not seen it yet.

09:52:06 15

Q. Do you know if any videos were taken

09:52:06 16

of the vehicle subsequent to this accident?

09:52:08 17

A. I don't know.

09:52:08 18

MR. KAPLEN: Mr. Butler, were any

09:52:20 19

videos taken?

09:52:22 20

MR. BUTLER: Not to my knowledge.

09:52:22 21

Q. Now, on February 25th of 2007 can you

09:52:30 22

tell me by whom were you employed?

09:52:34 23

A. Niederlander Organization.

09:52:38 24

Q. What is your business or profession?

25

A. My profession is an assistant

09:52:40 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:52:44 2

carpenter. I'm a stagehand.

09:52:44 3

Q. How long were you employed by them?

09:52:46 4

A. I have been working in the business
for over 32 and a half years.

09:52:50 6

Q. At that time did you have any other
employment in addition to your employment with
Niederlander?

09:52:54 9

A. I don't understand.

09:52:56 10

Q. Were you employed anyplace else on
February 25th?

09:52:56 12

A. No.

09:53:00 13

Q. Did you have any other independent
work that you did in addition to working with
Niederlander?

09:53:02 16

A. No.

09:53:06 17

Q. Did you have any independent business
that you operated in addition to your employment
with Niederlander?

09:53:10 20

A. No.

09:53:16 21

Q. Approximately what time did this
incident happen with Sabina Paradi?

09:53:24 23

A. Approximately 9:20 p.m. Sunday night.

09:53:26 24

Q. Where were you coming from?

25

A. I was coming from work.

09:53:26 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:53:30 2

Q. Where was that?

09:53:32 3

A. The Mintzcoff Theater.

09:53:34 4

Q. Where was that located?

09:53:34 5

A. Between 44th and 45th street and

09:53:38 6

Broadway.

09:53:38 7

Q. What time did you get to work that

09:53:40 8

day?

9

A. I got to work that day at twelve

09:53:42 10

o'clock.

09:53:42 11

Q. What time did your employment end

09:53:44 12

that day?

09:53:52 13

A. 9:05.

09:53:54 14

Q. During the course of that day did you have any alcoholic beverages to drink?

09:53:56 16

A. No.

09:53:58 17

Q. During the course of that day were you under any type of medication?

09:54:04 19

A. I had Advil Sinus And Cold Medicine.

09:54:06 20

Q. And that was for a common cold?

09:54:08 21

A. Yes.

09:54:12 22

Q. When was the last time that you took this medication prior to 9:05 p.m.

09:54:14 23

A. At lunchtime that day.

09:54:22 24

Q. After you left your place of

25

09:54:24 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:54:26 2

employment, what was your intended destination?

09:54:28 3

A. Going home.

09:54:28 4

Q. At the time of this incident was

09:54:28 5

there anybody in your vehicle?

09:54:32 6

A. No.

09:54:34 7

Q. From the time that you got in your

09:54:36 8

vehicle intending to go home, did you have

09:54:38 9

anybody in your vehicle that you dropped off

09:54:38 10

prior to this incident?

09:54:42 11

A. No.

09:54:48 12

Q. Prior to reaching the location of

09:54:50 13

this accident which I understand to be Ninth

09:54:52 14

Avenue and West 37th Street in Manhattan, did you

09:54:52 15

make any stops?

09:54:58 16

A. No.

09:54:58 17

Q. Did you have anything to eat during

09:54:58 18

the course of that day?

09:55:00 19

A. Yes.

09:55:02 20

Q. How many meals did you eat?

09:55:02 21

A. Two meals.

09:55:04 22

Q. What meals were those?

09:55:08 23

A. I don't remember. I don't know.

09:55:12 24

Q. While you were in your vehicle

25

proceeding to this location, were you eating

09:55:12 1 MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:55:12 2 anything at the time?

09:55:14 3 A. No.

09:55:16 4 Q. Were you drinking at the time

09:55:16 5 anything?

09:55:18 6 A. No.

09:55:18 7 Q. Any coffee or soda or water?

09:55:22 8 A. No.

09:55:22 9 Q. Do you own a cell phone?

09:55:24 10 A. Yes.

09:55:24 11 Q. Did you own a cell phone on

09:55:24 12 February 25th?

09:55:26 13 A. Yes.

09:55:26 14 Q. Is it the same cell phone that you

09:55:26 15 own today?

09:55:28 16 A. No.

09:55:30 17 Q. The same phone number?

09:55:32 18 A. The same phone number, yes.

09:55:36 19 Q. What is that phone number?

09:55:38 20 A. 908-227-8932.

09:55:38 21 Q. What carrier is that?

09:55:46 22 A. Verizon.

09:55:50 23 Q. From the time that I got into the

09:55:52 24 vehicle at approximately 9:05 until the time of

25 that incident, did you use that cell phone for

09:55:52 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:55:54 2

any reason?

09:56:04 3

A. No.

09:56:04 4

Q. Did you use the cell phone after the
09:56:06 5 incident?

09:56:06 6

A. Yes.

09:56:08 7

Q. Who did you call afterwards?

09:56:08 8

A. I called my wife.

09:56:10 9

Q. Did you call anybody else?

09:56:12 10

A. And I called the person that I was
09:56:16 11 supposed to work for the following morning.

09:56:16 12

Q. Where were you supposed to work the
09:56:20 13 following morning?

09:56:22 14

A. At the Imperial Theater.

09:56:24 15

Q. You work for Niederlander but your
09:56:26 16 place of employment would change from theater to
09:56:26 17 theater on any given date?

09:56:28 18

A. Yes.

09:56:30 19

Q. Was your truck equipped with a radio?

09:56:34 20

A. No.

21

Q. Was it equipped with a CB radio of
09:56:36 22 any kind?

09:56:42 23

A. No.

09:56:44 24

Q. Now, you were traveling prior to this
25 incident on West 37th Street?

09:56:46 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:56:46 2

A. Yes.

09:56:48 3

Q. And you were going westbound?

09:56:50 4

A. Yes.

09:56:54 5

Q. As you approached the intersection of

09:57:00 6

Ninth Avenue what were the weather conditions?

09:57:06 7

A. Snowing, nasty, dark, icy, wet.

09:57:08 8

Q. Had there been any accumulation of
snow on the roadway?

09:57:24 10

A. Slush, ice, wet roadways.

09:57:30 11

Q. How long had it been snowing?

09:57:30 12

A. The whole day, pretty much. I guess
the whole day.

09:57:36 14

Q. While you were driving and you were
approaching this intersection of Ninth Avenue and
West 37th Street, can you describe the snow
conditions for me as being light, medium or heavy
or something else?

09:57:48 19

A. Heavy.

09:57:48 20

Q. Did you have windshield wipers in
your truck?

09:57:50 22

A. Yes.

09:57:50 23

Q. Were they operational?

09:57:52 24

A. Yes.

25

Q. Were you using them at the time?

09:57:52 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:57:54 2

A. Yes.

09:57:56 3

Q. Did your truck have lights, yes?

09:57:56 4

A. Yes.

09:57:56 5

Q. Were these lights on?

09:58:00 6

A. Yes.

09:58:02 7

Q. As you approached West 37th Street

09:58:06 8

and the intersection of Ninth Avenue, how many lanes of travel are there on West 37th Street?

09:58:14 10

A. Two.

09:58:14 11

Q. Is that in addition to lanes for parked vehicles?

09:58:18 13

A. That is in addition to lanes for parked vehicles.

09:58:22 14

Q. Would there be lanes for parked vehicles on West 37th Street both on the left and right side?

09:58:28 18

A. Yes.

09:58:30 19

Q. As you were approaching this intersection of Ninth Avenue while traveling on West 37th Street were there any cars parked in either the right or left lane?

09:58:36 20

A. Yes.

09:58:36 21

Q. Both or one?

09:58:38 23

A. Both. There were cars on the left

25

09:58:40 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:58:48 2

and the right.

09:58:48 3

Q. Were both moving lanes, the two lanes

09:58:52 4

that you described open for the flow of traffic?

09:58:52 5

A. Yes.

09:58:54 6

Q. Were you familiar with this

09:58:54 7

intersection?

09:58:56 8

A. Yes.

09:58:58 9

Q. Is this an intersection that you

09:59:00 10

would pass on a regular basis?

09:59:02 11

A. Yes.

09:59:02 12

Q. What was your intended route when you

09:59:06 13

reached this intersection?

09:59:10 14

A. Approaching the Lincoln Tunnel.

09:59:12 15

Q. And that would be an approach from

09:59:12 16

Ninth Avenue?

09:59:14 17

A. Yes.

09:59:18 18

Q. And that would be an approach from

09:59:20 19

Ninth Avenue. If you got onto Ninth Avenue and

09:59:24 20

you were going to go to the Lincoln Tunnel, where

09:59:26 21

would you then get on to the Lincoln Tunnel?

09:59:28 22

A. The two extreme right lanes.

09:59:30 23

Q. How far would you travel on Ninth

09:59:34 24

Avenue before the entrance to the Lincoln Tunnel?

25

A. Right on Ninth Avenue right from the

09:59:38 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

09:59:52 2

middle before 37th Street and 36th Street.

09:59:54 3

Q. Following this incident, did the New York City Police arrive?

09:59:56 5

A. Yes.

09:59:58 6

Q. Did you speak to the New York City Police?

10:00:00 8

A. Yes.

10:00:00 9

Q. Did you give them a written statement?

10:00:04 11

A. New York City Police, no.

10:00:06 12

Q. Did you sign a statement for the New York City Police?

10:00:16 14

A. No, I don't recall. It was very confusing. I don't recall, maybe, I may have not.

10:00:16 16

Q. Do you recall speaking to them?

10:00:20 18

A. Sorry, yes, I recall speaking to them.

10:00:22 20

Q. Did they ask you questions concerning this incident?

10:00:24 22

A. Yes.

10:00:26 23

Q. Did you answer those questions truthfully and honestly?

10:00:26 24

A. To the best of my knowledge.

10:00:30 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:00:32 2

Q. And you understood that questions

10:00:36 3

that the New York Police Department were asking

10:00:36 4

you were in connection with their investigation

10:00:38 5

of this incident?

10:00:38 6

A. At times.

10:00:40 7

Q. I'm sorry?

10:00:42 8

A. At times I understood.

10:00:44 9

Q. What do you mean by at times?

10:00:44 10

A. Because I had to ask them a couple of
times to repeat the question.

10:00:48 12

Q. You understood why they were asking
you questions?

10:00:50 14

A. Yes.

10:00:50 15

Q. It was in connection with this
incident and the investigation that they were
conducting?

10:00:54 18

A. Yes.

10:00:56 19

Q. And you were not under the influence
of any drugs or medication?

10:00:58 21

A. No.

22

Q. That impaired your thinking in any
way?

24

A. No.

25

(Plaintiff's Exhibit 7

1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:01:04 2 for identification, Statement.)

10:01:10 3 Q. I show you a document marked as

10:01:10 4 Plaintiffs Exhibit 7 and ask you if you have ever

10:01:20 5 seen this document before today?

10:01:42 6 MR. KAPLEN: Mr. Butler, I have a

10:01:44 7 copy for you.

10:01:44 8 (Witness reviewing document.)

10:01:46 9 Q. My question to you, have you ever

10:01:46 10 seen that document before today?

10:01:48 11 A. Yes, I have.

10:01:50 12 Q. When was the last time prior to

10:01:52 13 entering into the room that you saw this

10:01:52 14 document?

10:01:54 15 A. I don't recall.

10:01:54 16 Q. Did your lawyer ever show you this

10:01:56 17 document?

10:01:58 18 A. No.

10:02:02 19 Q. Did anybody on behalf of your lawyer

10:02:02 20 and anybody else representing you in this matter

10:02:04 21 ever show you this document?

10:02:06 22 A. No.

10:02:06 23 Q. Anybody ever read to you the contents

10:02:12 24 of this document?

25 A. After I had told the policeman what

10:02:14 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:02:18 2

happened, he reread it to me and that was it.

10:02:20 3

Q. This document was dictated by you to
the police officer?

10:02:24 5

A. It was dictated to me by the police
officer after I had told him.

7

Q. You told him what happened, he wrote
it down?

10:02:28 9

A. Yes.

10:02:30 10

Q. And then he read it back?

10:02:34 11

A. Yes, he read it back to me.

10:02:34 12

Q. After he read it back to you, did you
then sign this document?

10:02:38 14

A. Yes.

10:02:38 15

Q. Is the signature on the bottom your
signature?

10:02:52 17

A. Yes.

10:02:56 18

Q. Is this statement by you a truthful
recitation of the events that took place on
February 25th, 2007 in connection with the
incident involving Miss Paradi?

10:03:10 22

A. At the time of the incident it is as
accurate as it could be.

10:03:12 23

Q. Have things changed since then to
render this document inaccurate in any way?

25

10:03:18 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:03:20 2

A. Yes.

10:03:26 3

Q. What has changed?

10:03:30 4

A. Just how things had happened and
being confused, I was confused and very extremely
upset that night.

10:03:36 7

Q. What things have changed since this
incident concerning what happened?

10:03:44 9

A. Just mentally my mind has changed. I
don't know. I don't know, but I don't know.

10:03:48 10

Q. You were being truthful and honest
then, weren't you?

10:03:50 13

A. Yes, sir.

10:03:54 14

Q. And you were attempting at that point
to give a full and complete recitation of what
happened, right?

10:03:58 17

A. Yes.

10:04:00 18

Q. When you gave this statement to the
New York City Police you didn't discuss this
incident with anybody first, right?

10:04:12 21

A. No, sir.

10:04:14 22

Q. Tell me at the present time what do
you believe to be inaccurate about this
statement? Before you answer that question, I
will ask you please to do this for me. Can you

25

10:04:34 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:04:36 2

read the statement that was read to you by the

10:04:36 3

New York City Police Department before you signed

10:04:38 4

this document?

10:04:40 5

A. It was dark.

10:04:42 6

Q. Can you read it now?

10:04:44 7

A. Can I read it now?

10:04:44 8

Q. Can you read it into the record for
us?

10:04:48 10

A. Yes.

10:04:50 11

Q. And what you're going to read now is
what was read to you by the police department
before you signed this document?

10:04:52 13

A. Yes.

10:04:58 15

Q. Read that, please?

10:05:00 16

A. "I was Westbound on 37th Street in
the right lane, two cars were to my left. I was
going to make a left turn on Ninth Avenue. The
two cars to my left went straight on Ninth
Avenue. At Ninth Avenue. We had the green light
as the two cars cleared I began to make may turn
and I didn't even see them. I heard the bang and
stopped."

10:05:32 21

Q. Then a place for your signature?

25

A. Yes.

10:05:34 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:05:34 2

Q. And you signed it at that location?

10:05:36 3

A. Yes.

10:05:38 4

Q. And that was signed by you after it
was read to you by the police officer?

10:05:48 6

A. Yes.

10:05:48 7

Q. What about that statement do you now
contend is inaccurate?

10:05:54 9

A. That the second car that was making --
that was going straight had its left blinker on
and I had stated it also and it was not put in
the report.

10:06:06 13

Q. Say this again for me?

10:06:10 14

A. The second car that was to my left
that went straight had its left blinker on and it
was not put into the report.

10:06:14 17

Q. Anything else inaccurate about this
report?

10:06:18 19

A. Not to my knowledge right there, no.

10:06:18 20

MR. BUTLER: The statement part of
the report?

10:06:22 22

MR. KAPLEN: Just what he read into
the record.

10:06:30 24

MR. BUTLER: Yes.

25

Q. Now, there is then a series of

10:06:36 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:06:40 2

questions and written answers in some boxes under
what you just read. Okay, do you see that on
this statement?

10:06:44 5

A. Yes.

10:06:48 6

Q. Were those the answers that you gave
to the police department at the scene?

10:07:04 7

A. Yes.

10:07:08 9

Q. Were those answers read to you before
you signed the bottom of this statement?

10:07:08 11

A. Yes.

10:07:10 12

Q. Are those answers accurate?

10:07:12 13

A. Yes.

10:07:14 14

Q. Anything inaccurate about those
answers?

10:07:32 16

A. Not to my knowledge.

10:07:34 17

Q. Since this incident, have you given a
written statement to anybody else?

10:07:36 19

A. Yes.

10:07:38 20

Q. Who was that?

10:07:42 21

A. My insurance company.

10:07:42 22

Q. Anybody else in addition to that
insurance company?

10:07:52 24

A. Not to my knowledge.

25

Q. Did you give one written statement --

10:07:56 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:07:58 2

A. Sorry, except for the highway patrol

10:08:00 3

policeman.

10:08:04 4

Q. That is what we just read?

5

A. This was highway patrol or the New

10:08:06 6

York City Police.

10:08:08 7

Q. Did you give more than one statement?

10:08:10 8

A. New York City Police, there is an

10:08:12 9

accident report.

10:08:14 10

MR. BUTLER: The question is did you
give a written report.

10:08:20 12

Q. In addition -- let's stop. At the
scene, in addition to signing this statement, did
you sign any other statement?

10:08:28 15

A. Yes.

10:08:28 16

Q. Was that one statement or more than
one statement?

10:08:36 18

A. I don't remember.

10:08:40 19

Q. The additional statement that you
signed at the scene, did that have any different
information other than what you just read into
the record?

10:08:54 23

A. The additional information that I
signed was for my insurance provider at home.

10:08:58 24

Q. So you gave additional information in

10:08:58 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:09:00 2 the statement that you gave at home to someone

10:09:00 3 else?

10:09:00 4 A. Yes.

10:09:04 5 Q. And this statement that you gave to

10:09:06 6 your insurance agent, was this a written

10:09:08 7 statement that you wrote or that somebody else

10:09:08 8 wrote and you signed?

10:09:10 9 A. Someone else wrote and I signed.

10:09:12 10 Q. How many pages was that statement?

10:09:14 11 A. I don't recall.

10:09:16 12 Q. Do you know who took that statement

10:09:16 13 from you?

10:09:18 14 A. Not offhand, no.

10:09:18 15 Q. Do you know what the purpose of that

10:09:20 16 statement was?

10:09:24 17 A. Investigation.

10:09:26 18 Q. When was that statement given?

10:09:28 19 A. I don't recall.

10:09:30 20 MR. KAPLEN: I would ask,

10:09:32 21 Mr. Butler, for a copy of that statement.

10:09:36 22 MR. BUTLER: I believe that that

10:09:36 23 statement falls within both work product and the

10:09:42 24 attorney-client privilege.

25 Q. In addition to that statement and the

10:09:44 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:09:46 2

statements that you gave at the scene to the
police department, have you ever given any
written statements to anybody else?

10:09:52 5

A. No.

10:09:52 6

Q. Have you ever given any taped
statements to anybody else?

10:09:58 8

A. No.

10:10:02 9

Q. Have you ever revisited this location
for the purposes of looking and taking a walk
around or anything else in connection with this
incident?

10:10:10 13

A. No.

10:10:12 14

Q. Has anybody ever shown you
photographers of this location?

16

A. Of this location?

17

Q. Yes.

10:10:14 18

A. Yes.

10:10:16 19

Q. Who was that?

10:10:22 20

A. My insurance provider who took the
statement. Just the pictures themselves of the
location.

10:10:26 23

Q. Did he ask you to mark those pictures
in any way to show him different things?

25

A. No.

10:10:30 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:10:32 2

Q. In addition to that individual from
the insurance company showing you any
photographs, has anybody else shown you any
photographs?

10:10:40 6

A. No.

10:10:42 7

Q. Have you ever seen photographs taken
by the New York City Police Department?

10:10:44 9

A. No.

10:10:48 10

Q. Have you ever seen any photographs
that were provided to your attorney by my office
concerning this location?

10:11:14 13

A. No.

10:11:14 14

Q. At the scene of this incident, did
you speak to any witnesses?

10:11:18 16

A. No.

10:11:18 17

Q. Do you know if there are any
witnesses?

10:11:22 19

A. Not to my knowledge.

10:11:24 20

Q. In addition to speaking to police
officers at the scene, did you speak to anybody
else?

10:11:46 23

A. No.

10:11:48 24

Q. Now, did your truck strike Sabina
Paradi?

25

10:11:48 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:11:52 2

A. I don't know.

10:11:54 3

Q. Did you hear any sound indicating

10:11:56 4

that your vehicle made contact with an

10:11:58 5

individual?

10:12:02 6

A. I heard a loud bang.

10:12:02 7

Q. Was that bang on the right side of

10:12:02 8

your truck or left side?

10:12:04 9

A. Left side.

10:12:06 10

Q. Where on the left side was that bang?

10:12:12 11

A. Left front fender.

10:12:16 12

Q. Before you heard that bang did you

10:12:18 13

see any pedestrians crossing the intersection of

10:12:18 14

Ninth Avenue and West 37th Street?

10:12:22 15

A. No.

10:12:24 16

Q. Did you see any pedestrians standing

10:12:24 17

on any of the corners waiting to cross?

10:12:26 18

A. No.

10:12:30 19

Q. Was your visibility of the

10:12:34 20

intersection of West 37th Street and Ninth Avenue

10:12:38 21

obstructed in any way as you were making your

10:12:38 22

turn -- were you making a turn from West 37th

10:12:38 23

Street on to Ninth Avenue?

10:12:40 24

A. Yes.

25

Q. And that would be a left turn?

10:12:40 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:12:42 2

A. Yes.

10:12:46 3

Q. Was your visibility obstructed in any way while you were making that turn from West 37th Street on to Ninth Avenue?

10:12:48 5

A. Just the weather conditions.

10:13:02 6

Q. Were you able to see clearly through your front windshield with the windshield wipers operating?

10:13:04 10

A. Yes.

10:13:04 11

Q. Your visibility of the curbs weren't obstructed in any way?

10:13:06 13

A. Besides the slush and ice.

10:13:06 14

Q. Was it just the slush and ice?

10:13:10 15

A. Yes.

10:13:14 16

Q. Was your visibility of the crosswalk itself where people would be walking obstructed in any way? And I don't mean any slush or snow on the ground. You could see clearly?

10:13:30 20

A. I don't recall. I don't remember.

10:13:34 21

Q. At the time that you heard this impact with the left front fender of your vehicle, what speed were you traveling at?

10:13:38 23

A. Approximately three miles an hour.

10:13:42 24

Q. Had you completed your turn yet?

10:13:42 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:13:46 2

A. No.

10:13:46 3

Q. Where on the roadway was your

10:13:50 4

vehicle?

5

A. I don't remember. I don't know. I

10:13:54 6

don't know.

10:13:56 7

Q. Was it on anyway -- let's do this

10:14:00 8

first. I'm going to show you some photographs

10:14:04 9

that we have marked Plaintiff's Exhibit s 1

10:14:08 10

through 6. I ask you to look at these

10:14:10 11

photographs first and then I will ask you some

12

questions about them. Okay?

10:14:10 13

(Plaintiff's Exhibit 1-6

10:14:16 14

for identification, Photographs.).

10:14:26 15

(Witness reviewing document.)

10:14:26 16

MR. KAPLEN: Do you want to look at

10:14:28 17

them, Mr. Butler?

10:14:36 18

MR. BUTLER: Please.

10:14:38 19

MR. KAPLEN: Those are enlargements

10:14:38 20

of the photographs that I previously provided to

10:14:56 21

you.

10:14:58 22

Q. Could you just flip through those

10:15:38 23

pictures, and I'm going to be asking you

10:15:42 24

questions about these photographs. I don't want

25

you to think I'm crazy, but we have to do this in

10:15:44 1 MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:15:46 2 a certain way under our legal proceedings. I
10:15:48 3 show you what is marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 1
10:15:50 4 for identification and ask you if you recognize
10:15:52 5 this, what is depicted on that photo?

10:15:54 6 A. Yes.

10:15:56 7 Q. Can you tell us, please?

10:16:00 8 A. West 37th Street and Ninth Avenue.

10:16:02 9 Q. Is that a fair and accurate depiction
10:16:04 10 of this location as it existed at the time of
10:16:04 11 this incident on February 25th?

10:16:06 12 A. No.

10:16:10 13 Q. In what way is it different?

10:16:12 14 A. The weather, it was snowing, roads
10:16:14 15 were not clear and it was dark.

10:16:16 16 Q. Other than that, is the geographic
10:16:20 17 depiction accurate?

10:16:26 18 A. Yes, geographically, yes.

10:16:28 19 Q. Can you tell us Plaintiff's Exhibit 2
10:16:30 20 except for the weather conditions and the fact
10:16:34 21 that this was taken in the daytime rather than
10:16:38 22 evening is also a fair and accurate depiction of
10:16:40 23 this location of Ninth Avenue and West 37th
10:16:54 24 Street as it existed on February 25th of 2007?

25 A. Yes, whatever the road conditions

10:16:56 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:16:58 2

there are, I don't know.

10:17:00 3

Q. Understanding that all of those

10:17:04 4

pictures that I'm going to show you were taken in

10:17:06 5

daylight and understanding that it was snowing

10:17:10 6

that night, I will ask you to look at each one of

10:17:14 7

these to tell me if each one of these is a fair

10:17:18 8

and accurate depiction of this intersection as it

10:17:20 9

appeared on February 25th. Exhibit 3, fair and

10:17:24 10

accurate depiction?

10:17:26 11

A. Yes.

10:17:30 12

Q. Exhibit 4?

10:17:32 13

A. Yes.

10:17:42 14

Q. Exhibit 5?

10:17:42 15

A. Yes.

10:17:50 16

Q. Exhibit 6?

10:17:56 17

A. Yes.

10:18:00 18

Q. Now, looking at Exhibit No. 6, we are

10:18:02 19

looking at a view of Ninth Avenue going

10:18:02 20

southbound?

10:18:06 21

A. Yes.

10:18:06 22

Q. And that would be the street that you

10:18:08 23

would be turning on to?

10:18:16 24

A. Yes, sir.

25

Q. Looking at this photo, Exhibit 6, can

10:18:22 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:18:26 2

you tell us, please, or point to me, please,

10:18:36 3

where your vehicle was when you heard this

10:18:42 4

sound? And if you could put a X at that spot.

5

A. I don't know. I don't know. I don't

10:18:52 6

know.

10:18:52 7

Q. You were in the process of making the

10:18:54 8

turn?

10:18:56 9

A. Yes.

10:19:04 10

Q. And Ninth Avenue at this location has

10:19:06 11

five lanes for moving traffic, okay. Two of

10:19:10 12

those being on the right and those would be the

10:19:12 13

lanes for turning into the Lincoln Tunnel?

10:19:14 14

A. Yes.

10:19:18 15

Q. Was it your intent to get into one of

10:19:18 16

these two right lanes as you were making your

10:19:24 17

turn?

10:19:28 18

A. Yes.

10:19:32 19

Q. When you made your left turn on to

10:19:34 20

Ninth Avenue, did you get on to Ninth Avenue in

10:19:36 21

any location other than these two right lanes?

10:19:38 22

A. I don't know.

10:19:40 23

Q. I'm asking you --

10:19:44 24

A. I don't know. I don't know. When I

25

turned left I started approaching left and I

10:19:46 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:19:48 2

heard the bang. I don't know what position my

10:19:52 3

truck was in, whether it was in the two right

10:19:52 4

lanes approaching the Lincoln Tunnel or in the

10:19:54 5

middle approach, I don't know.

10:19:58 6

Q. You could have been in the third lane

10:19:58 7

or fourth lane or any lane for that matter, you

10:20:00 8

just don't know?

10:20:14 9

A. I don't know.

10:20:16 10

Q. As you were making that turn, did you

10:20:24 11

observe any pedestrians standing in the location

10:20:26 12

where the H&R Block office is located?

10:20:26 13

A. I don't know. I did not see anyone

.0:20:30 14

there.

10:20:32 15

Q. And -- I'm going to show you --

16

A. If there was anyone there, I don't

10:20:34 17

know.

10:20:40 18

Q. I show you Exhibit 3, and would that

10:20:42 19

be the view as you were making your left turn?

10:20:46 20

A. Yes.

10:20:46 21

Q. And again you see the H&R Block

10:20:48 22

location?

10:20:50 23

A. Yes.

10:20:54 24

Q. And that would be on the side of the

25

street where the two right turning lanes would be

10:20:54 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:20:56 2

for the tunnel?

10:20:58 3

A. Yes.

10:21:00 4

Q. And as you were making your turn, do

10:21:00 5

you know if any pedestrians were standing on that

10:21:02 6

corner?

10:21:04 7

A. I don't know.

10:21:10 8

Q. Before you started making your turn,

10:21:12 9

did you see any pedestrians crossing Ninth Avenue

10:21:12 10

either westbound or eastbound?

10:21:14 11

A. No.

10:21:14 12

Q. No, you didn't or no, you don't

10:21:16 13

recall?

10:21:26 14

A. No, I did not see anyone crossing.

10:21:30 15

Q. Plaintiff's Exhibit 4, is that

10:21:34 16

another view of West 37th Street in the direction

10:21:36 17

that you were traveling as you were approaching

10:21:38 18

this intersection of Ninth Avenue?

10:21:48 19

A. Yes, it is.

10:21:52 20

Q. Is Plaintiff's Exhibit 1 another view

10:21:54 21

of the direction that you were traveling on West

10:21:56 22

37th Street as you were approaching Ninth Avenue?

10:22:00 23

A. Yes.

10:22:04 24

Q. And Exhibit 2 would be the view of

25

someone who was standing by the H&R Block

10:22:08 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:22:18 2

location looking on down West 37th Street?

10:22:20 3

A. Yes.

10:22:24 4

Q. The sound that you heard, I'm sorry,

10:22:24 5

was that a loud sound, light sound, what kind of

10:22:24 6

sound?

10:22:28 7

A. Loud.

10:22:28 8

Q. Can you mimic that kind of sound for
us?

10:22:30 10

A. No.

10:22:32 11

Q. Did you understand what that sound
was after you heard it?

10:22:42 13

A. That either someone hit my truck with
a car or someone's hands laid on my car, my truck
fender.

10:22:48 16

Q. Just prior to hearing that sound, did
you see anyone crossing in front of your truck
either from the right or from the left?

10:23:26 19

A. No.

10:23:28 20

Q. After you heard that sound, what did
you do in regard to the operation of your truck?

10:23:32 22

A. I stopped it immediately. Put the
emergency brake on and got out of my truck to see
what the noise was from.

10:23:34 23

10:23:36 24

Q. And what did you see?

25

10:23:42 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:23:44 2

A. I saw a young woman laying down on

10:23:46 3

Ninth Avenue.

10:23:48 4

Q. Where was she in relationship to this

10:23:48 5

crosswalk?

10:23:50 6

A. I don't know.

10:23:50 7

Q. Was she in the crosswalk?

10:23:52 8

A. I don't know.

10:23:54 9

Q. Why don't you know?

10:23:58 10

A. Because of the street conditions, the road conditions, I don't know. Slush. I don't

10:24:00 12

know.

10:24:02 13

Q. Did this happen in the middle of the street somewhere or near somewhere in the vicinity of the crosswalk?

16

A. It could have been in the vicinity.

10:24:12 17

I don't know.

10:24:14 18

Q. How far in your turn were you when you heard this sound?

10:24:24 20

A. Maybe three quarters of the way in.

10:24:28 21

Maybe.

10:24:30 22

Q. Was anybody by this young woman that you saw on the ground?

10:24:30 24

A. Yes.

25

Q. Who was that?

10:24:32 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:24:34 2

A. A young man.

10:24:34 3

Q. And did you ever speak to that young
man?

10:24:40 5

A. No.

10:24:40 6

Q. Did you have any words to say with
him at all?

10:24:44 8

A. No, my reaction was oh, my God, what
happened here. That was it.

10:24:50 10

Q. This young lady on the ground, what
did you observe about her conditions?

10:25:00 12

A. I didn't. She was lying there and
there were a lot of people and I didn't. I was
asked to step away.

10:25:04 15

Q. There were a lot people as soon as
you got out of your truck?

10:25:14 17

A. The police van showed up, with plain
clothes police, New York City Police right there
on the spot.

10:25:16 20

Q. Before or after you got out of your
truck?

10:25:18 22

A. After.

10:25:22 23

Q. I'm asking when you got out of your
truck and you walked around and saw this girl on
the ground, in addition to the young man that was

25

10:25:30 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:25:30 2

with her, was there anybody else there at that
moment?

10:25:36 4

A. I don't know.

10:25:36 5

Q. How soon did the police van show up?

10:25:40 6

A. Within seconds.

10:25:42 7

Q. Do you know who called the police van
or if anybody called them?

10:25:46 9

A. I don't believe anybody did. I think
it was coincidence that they were there.

10:25:48 11

Q. Did you observe this girl on the
ground moving in any way?

10:25:52 13

A. I did not.

10:25:52 14

Q. Did you hear any sounds?

10:25:56 15

A. No.

10:25:58 16

Q. After you observed this girl on the
ground, what if anything did you do next?

10:26:04 18

A. I was asked to step to the sidewalk
away from the incident.

10:26:06 20

Q. Who asked you to do that?

10:26:08 21

A. The New York City Police.

10:26:08 22

Q. Did you do that?

10:26:10 23

A. Yes.

10:26:10 24

Q. Did you ever return to observe this
girl?

25

10:26:10 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:26:14 2

A. No.

10:26:16 3

Q. Did you ever speak to her or the

10:26:16 4

young man that she was with?

10:27:00 5

A. No.

10:27:02 6

Q. Did you observe whether this girl

10:27:06 7

that you saw on the ground had any bags or

8

packages, umbrellas, anything else with her at

10:27:08 9

that time?

10:27:10 10

A. I don't know. I did not.

10:27:10 11

Q. Do you know if the young man that she

10:27:14 12

was with did?

10:27:20 13

A. All I know is that he had very dark clothes on, what I had seen of him when he stood up overlooking his friend and I seen an umbrella

10:27:28 16

behind him in the middle of Ninth Avenue.

10:27:30 17

Q. Did you observe the kind of clothes that the girl was wearing?

10:27:34 19

A. She had light slacks on and I don't know what she was wearing on top because they were trying to keep her warm with other coats.

10:28:04 22

Q. Now, while you were traveling on West 37th Street approaching this intersection of Ninth Avenue, did you observe a traffic light?

25

A. Yes.

10:28:12 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:28:14 2

Q. Is there a traffic light controlling
this intersection of Ninth Avenue and 37th
Street?

10:28:16 4

A. Yes.

10:28:24 6

Q. As you approached this intersection
in the direction that you were proceeding on West
37th Street, that would be westbound?

10:28:28 9

A. Yes.

10:28:28 10

Q. Did you observe the color of the
traffic signal?

10:28:30 12

A. Yes.

10:28:32 13

Q. What color was it?

10:28:36 14

A. Red.

10:28:38 15

Q. Did you stop your vehicle because of
this red signal before you proceeded to make your
turn?

10:28:44 18

A. Yes.

10:28:46 19

Q. When you stopped your vehicle, were
there any cars in front of you?

10:28:50 21

A. No.

10:28:54 22

Q. And you would be the first car then
at this intersection of West 37th Street and
Ninth Avenue?

10:29:02 24

A. In the right lane, yes.

25

10:29:04 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:29:04 2

Q. You were intending to make a left turn from the right lane?

10:29:06 4

A. Yes.

10:29:10 5

Q. How long were you stopped there with the light being red before it turned to green?

10:29:12 7

A. I don't know.

10:29:14 8

Q. When you were stopped in this right-hand lane of West 37th Street at the intersection of Ninth Avenue, were there any cars in the lane immediately to your left?

10:29:22 12

A. Yes.

10:29:22 13

Q. And they were also stopped at this light?

10:29:24 15

A. Yes.

10:29:26 16

Q. Were there any cars behind you in the right lane?

10:29:32 18

A. I don't know.

10:29:36 19

Q. Now, if you were intending to make a left turn on to Ninth Avenue, can you tell me why you were in the right-hand lane as opposed to being in the left-hand lane while you were stopped at this intersection?

10:29:50 24

25

A. Yes. The two cars that were to my left, one car, the first car proceeded across

10:29:54 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:29:58 2

Ninth Avenue, the second car had its left blinker on proceeding to go in the Lincoln Tunnel, I presume and I proceeded to follow him, but that car decided to go straight.

10:30:08 6

Q. That is not the question I'm asking.

10:30:12 7

A. It's a common of traffic flow.

10:30:12 8

Q. You understand, sir, that to make a left turn --

10:30:16 10

A. Yes.

10:30:20 11

Q. -- from a street within the City of New York you should be in the left lane of the flow of traffic, do you understand that?

10:30:26 14

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection as far as that question.

10:30:36 16

Q. You can answer that question?

10:30:36 17

A. Yes.

10:30:38 18

Q. You understood that to be the law?

10:30:40 19

A. No.

10:30:42 20

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection to any questions along those lines.

10:30:48 22

Q. Understanding that you were supposed to be in the left-hand lane of West 37th Street to make the left turn, why were you not in the left lane but in the right lane?

25

10:30:54 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:30:56 2

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection to

10:31:00 3

the form of the question. You may answer it.

10:31:06 4

A. Because of the weather conditions.

10:31:08 5

Safer to drive a wide turn instead of a narrow

10:31:08 6

short turn to get across Ninth Avenue because of

10:31:10 7

the weather conditions.

10:31:14 8

Q. What about the weather conditions

10:31:14 9

made it safer the way that you intended to make

10:31:16 10

the turn?

10:31:20 11

A. So my truck would not slip around

10:31:24 12

instead of making a sharp left turn into and make

10:31:26 13

a quick turn into the Lincoln Tunnel. It's a

10:31:30 14

nice wide turn so the rear end of my truck

10:31:30 15

wouldn't slide out because of the road

10:31:32 16

conditions.

10:31:38 17

Q. While you were stopped at this

10:31:42 18

traffic light, did anybody cross in front of your

10:31:46 19

vehicle crossing West 37th Street either going

10:31:46 20

northbound or southbound?

10:31:52 21

A. I don't know. I don't recall.

10:31:54 22

Q. While you stopped at this traffic

10:32:00 23

light, did you observe any pedestrians crossing

10:32:04 24

West 37th Street on either the northbound --

25

crossing Ninth Avenue either on the northbound

10:32:08 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:32:08 2

side of West 37th Street or the southbound side
of West 37th Street?

10:32:18 4

A. I did not see any, no.

10:32:18 5

Q. Did you see any pedestrians walking
in that area that night?

10:32:30 7

A. I don't remember.

10:32:34 8

Q. After the light turned green the car
that was immediately to your left, what did that
vehicle do?

10:32:38 11

A. It went straight across Ninth Avenue.

10:32:42 12

Q. Did that vehicle turn?

10:32:42 13

A. The other vehicle did not turn.

10:32:44 14

Q. The first car?

10:32:46 15

A. Did not turn, it went straight.

10:32:48 16

Q. Did that first vehicle -- was this a
car or truck?

10:32:50 18

A. It was a car.

10:32:52 19

Q. Did that first vehicle have its
signal light on?

10:33:02 21

A. No.

10:33:06 22

Q. Did you start moving at the same time
as this first vehicle -- that this first vehicle
to your left after the light turned green?

10:33:08 23

25 A. No.

10:33:12 1 MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:33:12 2 Q. Who moved first?

10:33:14 3 A. The car moved first.

10:33:16 4 Q. The car to your left?

10:33:20 5 A. Yes.

10:33:22 6 Q. And how far did that car get through

10:33:28 7 this intersection before you started to move?

10:33:30 8 A. Approximately four feet.

10:33:30 9 Q. And then you started to move?

10:33:32 10 A. Yes.

10:33:34 11 Q. And then there is a car behind that

10:33:34 12 car on your left?

10:33:36 13 A. Yes.

10:33:36 14 Q. Was that a car or truck?

10:33:38 15 A. It was a car.

10:33:40 16 Q. And did you see that car start to

10:33:40 17 move before you started to move?

10:33:42 18 A. Yes.

10:33:44 19 Q. And did that car have its signal on?

10:33:46 20 A. Yes.

10:33:46 21 Q. Was that its left signal on?

10:33:48 22 A. Yes.

10:33:48 23 Q. Did that car turn on to Ninth Avenue?

10:33:54 24 A. No.

25 Q. Did you wait until that car proceeded

10:33:56 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:33:56 2

past you before you began to make your turn?

10:33:58 3

A. Yes.

10:34:00 4

Q. And as that car was proceeding past

10:34:00 5

you, were you moving or stopped?

10:34:06 6

A. I was stopped.

10:34:08 7

Q. What was your intent at being stopped

10:34:10 8

at that moment?

10:34:10 9

A. Waiting for the cars to clear so
there would be no accidents.

10:34:16 11

Q. Waiting for both of these cars on
your left to proceed in front of you and then you
would make this left turn behind them?

10:34:24 14

A. Yes.

10:34:24 15

Q. And did they both proceed in front of
you?

10:34:32 17

A. Yes.

10:34:36 18

Q. Did they both clear the intersection
of Ninth Avenue and West 37th Street before you
began to make your left turn?

10:34:42 21

A. No.

10:34:42 22

Q. Did either one of these vehicles --

10:34:44 23

A. I don't recall.

10:34:50 24

Q. Where was this second vehicle in
relationship to this intersection when you began

25

10:34:50 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

0:34:56 2

to work your left turn?

10:35:04 3

A. I don't know. I don't know.

10:35:08 4

Q. If we look at the roadway of Ninth

10:35:12 5

Avenue and West 37th Street, Plaintiff's Exhibit

10:35:16 6

, can you point to us where the second vehicle

10:35:16 7

would have been when you began to make your left

10:35:24 8

turn?

10:35:28 9

A. I don't know. I don't know.

10:35:28 10

Q. And that would be the same by looking

10:35:34 11

at any of the pictures?

12

A. Yes, it would be. Just, I don't

10:35:42 13

know.

0:35:46 14

Q. Looking at Plaintiff's Exhibit 1,

10:35:48 15

that would be West 37th Street in the direction

10:35:48 16

that you were traveling?

10:35:50 17

A. Yes.

10:35:50 18

Q. And that shows the two lanes of

10:35:52 19

traffic?

10:35:52 20

A. Yes.

10:35:54 21

Q. That we just discussed?

10:35:56 22

A. Yes.

10:35:58 23

Q. Could you put a checkmark in the lane

10:36:00 24

that your vehicle was in while you were stopped

25

at this traffic light?

10:36:00 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:36:08 2 A. Yes.

10:36:10 3 (Witness complies.)

10:36:12 4 Q. You put an X there?

10:36:12 5 A. Yes.

10:36:14 6 Q. I asked you --

10:36:16 7 A. Is that what you asked me to do?

10:36:20 8 Q. I asked you to make a checkmark, but

10:36:20 9 I need the record to reflect what you put. You
10:36:20 10 put an X there?

10:36:22 11 A. Yes.

10:36:24 12 Q. And that depicts the location that

10:36:24 13 you were stopped at this light?

10:36:26 14 A. Yes.

10:36:26 15 Q. And that is on Plaintiff's Exhibit 1?

10:36:28 16 A. Yes.

10:36:30 17 MR. BUTLER: It depicts the lane.

10:36:32 18 MR. KAPLEN: The lane, okay.

10:36:38 19 Q. Did you understand that when this
10:36:40 20 light turned green for the flow of traffic on
10:36:44 21 West 37th Street, that if there were any
10:36:48 22 pedestrians waiting to cross Ninth Avenue they
10:36:48 23 would also have a green signal in their favor?

10:36:52 24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And you understand that pedestrians

10:36:54 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:36:56 2

crossing Ninth Avenue would have the right of way
over your vehicle?

10:36:58 4

A. Yes.

10:37:02 5

Q. And you understand that it was your
obligation to yield to those pedestrians who were
crossing Ninth Avenue in either going westbound
or eastbound, you had an obligation to yield the
right of way to those pedestrians?

10:37:18 10

A. Yes.

10:37:20 11

Q. While you were in the process of
making this left turn, did you anticipate that
there might be any pedestrians crossing Ninth
Avenue at this location?

10:37:30 15

A. Yes, I stopped when the second car
proceeded to go forward and I didn't see anyone
in the crosswalks at all.

10:37:36 18

Q. Did you look left as well as right.

10:37:38 19

A. I looked left, right, forward.

10:37:40 20

Q. In addition to walking in the
crosswalk itself did you look on the curb?

10:37:42 22

A. No.

10:37:44 23

Q. So you don't know if there were any
pedestrians on the curb?

25

A. I have no idea, I don't know.

10:37:48 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:37:50 2

Q. As you were making your turn, did you

10:37:52 3

continue to look to see if there were any

10:37:56 4

pedestrians in the crosswalk either crossing

10:37:58 5

Ninth Avenue westbound or crossing Ninth Avenue

10:37:58 6

crossing eastbound?

10:38:00 7

A. I didn't see any.

10:38:00 8

Q. You looked?

10:38:02 9

A. I looked.

10:38:02 10

Q. And you didn't see anybody crossing

10:38:02 11

either way?

10:38:06 12

A. No, sir.

10:38:08 13

Q. And that was -- and you kept looking

10:38:08 14

until you heard this bang?

10:38:10 15

A. Yes.

10:38:12 16

Q. And you never saw anybody?

10:38:14 17

A. Never saw a person.

10:38:16 18

Q. Never saw anybody walking in the

10:38:16 19

crosswalk anywhere?

10:38:18 20

A. No.

10:38:20 21

Q. Did you see anybody walking outside

10:38:20 22

of the crosswalk crossing Ninth Avenue?

10:38:44 23

A. No.

10:38:48 24

Q. As you were looking anticipating that

25

there might be pedestrians crossing Ninth Avenue,

10:38:50 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:38:56 2

was your view obstructed in any way?

10:39:06 3

A. No, not to my knowledge, no.

10:39:08 4

Q. Other than this evening did you take
any special precautions of any kind because of
the road or weather conditions?

10:39:12 7

A. Yes.

10:39:12 8

Q. What special precautions did you
take?

10:39:18 10

A. Driving slow, carefully making sure
that everything was working on my truck safely.

10:39:24 12

Make sure that the windows were not fogged up.

10:39:28 13

Everything was clear, clean, the snow was off my
truck, the outside review mirrors were wiped
down, the windshield, back window and the back of
my truck was wiped down clear of any snow debris.

10:39:42 17

Q. Was your windshield clear of snow
debris as you were making this turn?

10:39:50 19

A. Yes, it was.

10:39:54 20

Q. One of the questions that was asked
of you at the scene was what was the cause of the
accident and in parentheses it says as part of
that answer "the other two cars that went
straight".

10:40:04 23

25

A. Yes.

10:40:14 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:40:18 2

Q. What manner do you claim that these two cars that went straight were in some way a cause of this accident?

10:40:24 5

A. The second car because it had its left blinker and I was watching the car to proceed to make a left and he did not and he proceeded to go straight away.

10:40:34 9

Q. How in your opinion was that a cause of you striking a pedestrian?

10:40:38 11

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection to the form of the question.

10:40:42 13

Q. How was that in your opinion a cause of this incident taking place?

10:40:50 15

A. Stopping quickly, watching the second car go and not seeing anybody in the crosswalk or anywhere around my truck.

10:41:00 18

Q. What do you mean stopping quickly?

10:41:04 19

A. Because the second car looked like it was making a left turn and it went straight instead, so as I was proceeding assuming that the car, the second car was going to make a left, so I had to stop the truck to let that car past and I proceeded to go and I heard the loud bang.

10:41:16 23

Q. After you began to move to make this

25

10:41:22 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:41:22 2

left turn, there came a point in time that you
stopped your vehicle?

10:41:26 4

A. Yes.

10:41:28 5

Q. Where was your vehicle in

10:41:28 6

relationship to this intersection when you

10:41:28 7

stopped it?

10:41:32 8

A. I don't know.

10:41:34 9

Q. Were you in any way into Ninth Avenue
already?

10:41:38 11

A. Yes, partially Ninth Avenue.

10:41:48 12

Q. How many lanes of Ninth Avenue did
you traverse when you stopped your vehicle?

10:41:48 14

A. I don't know.

10:41:48 15

Q. Was it at least one lane?

10:41:48 16

A. Yes.

10:41:48 17

Q. At least two lanes?

10:41:48 18

A. Possibly.

10:41:50 19

Q. Why did you stop your vehicle?

10:41:54 20

A. To let the second car go because I
realized that he was not making a left turn on to
Ninth Avenue.

10:41:56 23

Q. When you stopped your vehicle, did
you have a clear visibility of this intersection?

25

A. No.

10:42:00 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:42:02 2

Q. In what way was your view --

10:42:04 3

A. Snow --

10:42:10 4

Q. Let me finish my question. In what

10:42:10 5

way was your view of this intersection obstructed

10:42:12 6

when you stopped?

10:42:14 7

A. The snow, the weather, snowing very
heavy, visibility was not great, but it was
passable.

10:42:20 10

Q. Before you began to move again, did
you take a look to your left?

10:42:22 12

A. I don't know.

10:42:26 13

Q. Did you take a look to your right?

14

A. I was making a left-hand turn, I

10:42:30 15

don't know.

10:42:34 16

Q. You understand the pedestrians could
be crossing Ninth Avenue from either your left or
your right before you again proceeded to move?

10:42:38 19

A. Yes.

10:42:40 20

Q. And you understood that these
pedestrians would have the right of way?

10:42:42 22

A. Yes.

10:42:44 23

Q. And they would also be having a green
light?

10:42:44 24

A. Yes.

25

10:42:46 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:42:46 2

Q. And you don't know if you looked to
see them?

10:42:48 4

A. I did not see anyone.

10:42:52 5

Q. Did you look?

10:42:54 6

A. I don't know if I looked or not.

10:42:56 7

Q. So you don't know if you saw anybody
because you don't remember if you looked?

10:42:58 9

A. I did not see anyone.

10:42:58 10

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection to
the form of the question.

10:43:08 12

Q. When you started again to move after
you stopped for this vehicle who what is not
making its left turn, where were you looking?

10:43:20 15

A. Looking straight away toward the
entrance to the Lincoln Tunnel.

10:43:26 17

Q. At any time while your vehicle was
moving, did you skid?

10:43:30 19

A. No.

10:43:34 20

Q. When you applied your brake to stop
for this vehicle who you said you anticipated
making this left turn, did your vehicle skid in
any way?

10:43:42 24

A. No.

25

Q. Did you have any problem stopping

10:43:42 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:43:42 2

your vehicle?

10:43:48 3

A. No.

10:43:50 4

Q. After you began moving again after

10:43:58 5

you stopped for this other vehicle, how far did

10:44:02 6

your vehicle travel before you heard this sound?

7

A. Maybe five feet, six feet, maybe. I

10:44:06 8

don't know.

9

Q. Did you have your foot on the gas in
any way?

10:44:08 11

A. Very little, yes.

10:44:10 12

Q. What speed were you going?

10:44:36 13

A. Approximately three miles an hour.

10:44:38 14

Q. After you heard the sound in front of
your vehicle, did you ever sound your horn?

10:44:42 16

A. No.

10:44:44 17

Q. Did you ever attempt to apply your
brakes before you heard the sound?

10:44:48 19

A. No.

10:44:50 20

Q. After you came -- I know you came to
a stop so you had to apply your brakes and you
started moving again?

10:44:52 23

A. Yes.

10:44:56 24

Q. From the time you started moving
again until you heard this sound, did you ever

25

10:44:58 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:44:58 2

attempt to stop again?

10:45:32 3

A. No.

10:45:36 4

Q. From the time that you left the

10:45:42 5

accident scene, did you ever attempt to ascertain

10:45:42 6

that the condition of this girl that you saw on

10:45:44 7

this ground?

10:45:44 8

A. I have asked and I got no response
from anyone.

10:45:48 10

Q. From who?

10:45:50 11

A. I asked the police and they didn't
give me any response.

10:45:52 13

Q. Was that that same day or some other
day?

10:45:58 15

A. It was the same night after they had
taken her to the hospital.

10:46:00 17

Q. Did you accompany the police
anyplace?

10:46:04 19

A. No.

10:46:04 20

Q. Where did you go from the scene?

10:46:06 21

A. I went home.

10:46:08 22

Q. After you went home, did you ever
attempt to ascertain the condition of this girl?

10:46:10 23

A. Not when I got home that night, no.

25

MR. BUTLER: Note my objection to

10:46:16 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:46:16 2

the form of these questions. You may answer them.

10:46:22 4

Q. At any time after you went home, did you ever attempt to ascertain the condition of this girl?

10:46:30 7

A. No.

10:46:32 8

Q. When you saw this girl on the ground, did you observe her bleeding from anyplace?

10:46:42 10

A. I did not.

10:46:44 11

Q. What if anything did you observe the person that she was with saying?

10:46:48 13

A. Pardon?

10:46:50 14

Q. The person that she was with, this young man, what if anything did you hear him say?

10:47:14 16

A. I did not hear him say anything.

10:47:20 17

Q. Before you heard the sound on the left front side of your vehicle, did you see anybody at all crossing in front of your vehicle from right to left?

10:47:30 21

A. No.

10:47:30 22

MR. KAPLEN: Thank you, I have no further questions.

10:47:36 24

MR. BUTLER: Thank you.

25

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is 10:47

10:47:40 1

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

10:47:44 2

a.m. and this marks the end of tape 1 and the end
of the deposition. We are off the record.

4

(TIME NOTED: 10:41 A.M.)

5

6

7

MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS

8

9

Subscribed and sworn to before me

10

this _____ day of _____, 2007.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2 STATE OF NEW YORK) Pg ____ of ____ Pgs

3) ss:

4 COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

5 I wish to make the following changes, for
6 the following reasons:

7 PAGE LINE

8 _____ CHANGE: _____

9 _____ REASON: _____

10 _____ CHANGE: _____

11 _____ REASON: _____

12 _____ CHANGE: _____

13 _____ REASON: _____

14 _____ CHANGE: _____

15 _____ REASON: _____

16 _____ CHANGE: _____

17 _____ REASON: _____

18 _____ CHANGE: _____

19 _____ REASON: _____

20 _____ CHANGE: _____

21 _____ REASON: _____

22 _____ CHANGE: _____

23 _____ REASON: _____

24

25

1

C E R T I F I C A T E

3 STATE OF NEW YORK }

4 . 25

5 COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, WILLIAM VISCONTI, a Shorthand
Reporter and Notary Public within and for the
State of New York, do hereby certify:

10 That MICHAEL R. PHILLIPS, the witness
11 whose deposition is hereinbefore set forth, was
12 duly sworn by me and that such deposition is a
13 true record of the testimony given by the
14 witness.

15 I further certify that I am not
16 related to any of the parties to this action by
17 blood or marriage, and that I am in no way
18 interested in the outcome of this matter.

19 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
20 set my hand this 11 day of Sept, 2007.

WILLIAM VISCONTI

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

E X H I B I T S

DESCRIPTION	PAGE
(Plaintiff's Exhibit 7 for identification, Statement.).....	19
(Plaintiff's Exhibit 1-6 for identification, Photographs.).....	32

A able 31:7 accident 9:16 12:13 26:9 54:22 55:4 60:5 accidents 49:10 accompany 60:17 accumulation 15:8 accurate 21:23 25:12 33:9,17 33:22 34:8,10 action 1:8 4:10 64:16 addition 7:14 10:7,14,18 16:11,13 25:22 26:12,13 27:25 29:2,20 40:25 52:20 additional 26:19 26:23,25 administer 3:13 Advil 11:19 agent 27:6 agreed 3:2,6,10 4:5,10 alcoholic 11:15 answer 18:23 22:24 45:16 46:3 54:23 61:2 answers 6:7 25:2 25:6,9,12,15 anticipate 9:12 52:12 anticipated 58:21 anticipating 53:24 Antilock 8:13 anybody 7:2,17 12:5,9 14:9 20:19,20,23 22:20 25:18,22 28:4,7,14 29:4 29:21 39:22 41:2,8,9 46:18 53:10,16,18,21	55:16 58:7 61:19 anyplace 8:24 10:10 60:18 61:9 anyway 32:7 appeared 34:9 applied 58:20 apply 59:17,21 approach 17:15 17:18 36:5 approached 15:5 16:7 43:6 approaching 15:15 16:19 17:14 35:25 36:4 37:17,22 42:23 approximately 10:21,23 13:24 31:24 48:8 59:13 area 47:6 arranged 9:11 arrive 18:4 ascertain 60:5,23 61:5 asked 40:14 41:18 41:20 51:6,7,8 54:20 60:8,11 asking 5:22 19:3 19:12 32:23 35:23 40:23 45:6 assistant 9:25 assuming 55:21 attempt 59:17 60:2,5,23 61:5 attempting 22:14 attorney 29:11 attorneys 2:3,8 3:3 attorney-client 27:24 August 1:12 4:17 authorized 3:12 Automatic 8:15	Avenue 2:8 12:14 15:6,15 16:8,20 17:16,19,19,24 17:25 23:18,20 23:20 30:14,20 30:23 31:5 33:8 33:23 34:19 35:10,20,20 37:9,18,22 39:3 42:16,24 43:3 43:24 44:10,20 45:2 46:6,25 47:11 48:23 49:19 50:5 51:22 52:2,7,14 53:5,5,22,25 56:9,11,12,22 57:17 a.m 1:13 4:18 62:2,4	bottom 21:15 25:10 boxes 25:2 brake 38:23 58:20 brakes 8:11,13 59:18,21 Broadway 11:6 business 9:24 10:4,17 Butler 2:7 4:13 5:6,6 9:6,9,18 9:20 20:6 24:20 24:24 26:10 27:21,22 32:17 32:18 45:14,20 46:2 51:17 55:11 58:10 60:25 61:24	cause 54:21 55:4 55:9,13 CB 14:21 cell 13:9,11,14,25 14:4 certain 33:2 certify 64:9,15 change 14:16 63:8,10,12,14 63:16,18,20,22 changed 21:24 22:3,7,9 changes 63:5 checkmark 50:23 51:8 Chevrolet 8:5 City 2:9 18:4,6,11 18:13 22:19 23:3 26:6,8 29:8 40:18 41:21 45:11 CIV 1:8 Civil 1:8 claim 55:2 clean 54:13 clear 33:15 49:9 49:18 54:13,16 54:17 56:24 cleared 23:21 clearly 31:7,19 clothes 40:18 42:14,17 coats 42:21 coffee 13:7 coincidence 41:10 cold 11:19,20 color 9:7,13 43:10 43:13 coming 10:24,25 common 11:20 45:7 company 25:21 25:23 29:3 complete 22:15 completed 31:25 complies 51:3 concerning 5:22
		B B 65:2 back 21:10,11,12 54:15,15 bags 42:7 bang 23:22 30:6,7 30:10,12 36:2 53:14 55:24 basis 17:10 began 23:21 49:2 49:20,25 50:7 55:25 57:10 59:4 behalf 5:7 20:19 believe 22:23 27:22 41:9 best 18:25 beverages 11:15 Bill 5:9 bleeding 61:9 blinker 24:10,15 45:2 55:6 Block 36:12,21 37:25 blood 64:17 Bodo 1:6 4:22	C C 2:2 5:12 64:2,2 California 4:7 call 14:7,9 called 14:8,10 41:7,8 car 24:9,14 38:14 38:14 43:22 44:25,25 45:2,5 47:8,14,17,18 48:3,4,6,11,12 48:14,15,16,19 48:23,25 49:4 52:15 55:5,6,16 55:19,22,22,23 56:20 Caravan 7:13,14 carefully 54:10 CARO 2:3 carpenter 10:2 carrier 13:21 cars 16:21,25 23:17,19,21 case 5:5,21	

18:20 22:8 29:12 condition 60:6,23 61:5 conditions 15:6 15:17 31:6 33:20,25 39:10 39:11 40:11 46:4,7,8,16 54:6	crosswalks 52:17 curb 52:21,24 curbs 31:11 currently 6:13	discuss 22:19 discussed 50:21 District 1:2,3 4:24 4:25 document 20:3,5 20:8,10,14,17 20:21,24 21:3 21:13,25 23:4 23:13 32:15 Dodge 7:13,14 date 7:15 14:17 day 9:12 11:8,9 11:12,14,17,24 12:18 15:12,13 60:13,14 62:10 64:20 daylight 34:5 daytime 33:21 DE 2:3 debris 54:16,18 DeCaro 1:19 4:19 decided 45:5 declared 1:5 4:21 Defendant 1:10 2:8 4:11 5:7 Defendant's 4:4 department 19:3 23:3,12 25:7 28:3 29:8 depicted 33:5 depiction 33:9,17 33:22 34:8,10 depicts 51:12,17 deposition 1:17 3:11 4:11,19 62:3 64:11,12 describe 15:16 described 17:4 DESCRIPTION 65:3 destination 12:2 dictated 21:3,5 different 26:20 28:24 33:13 direction 37:16 37:21 43:7 50:15	ESQ 2:5,7 estate 4:9 evening 33:22 54:4 events 21:19 EXAMINATION 5:16 examined 5:14 Exhibit 19:25 20:4 32:9,13 drink 11:15 drinking 13:4 drive 46:5 driving 7:15 8:4 15:14 54:10 dropped 12:9 drugs 19:20 duly 5:13 64:12	flip 32:22 flow 17:4 45:7,13 51:20 fogged 54:12 follow 45:4 following 14:11 14:13 18:3 63:5 63:6 follows 5:15 foot 59:9 force 3:13 form 3:7 46:3 55:12 58:11 61:2 formal 4:6 formally 4:12 forth 64:11 forward 4:10 52:16,19 four 48:8 fourth 36:7 friend 42:15 front 30:11 31:8 31:22 38:17 43:20 46:18 49:12,15 59:14 61:18,19 full 6:19 22:15 further 3:6,10 61:23 64:15
		E E 2:2,2 5:12 64:2 64:2 65:2 eastbound 37:10 52:8 53:6 eat 12:17,20 eating 12:25 effect 3:14 either 16:22 37:10 38:13,18 46:19,24,25 49:22 52:7 53:4 53:11 57:17 emergency 38:23 employed 9:22 10:3,10 employment 10:7 10:7,18 11:11 12:2 14:16 Engelman 2:13 4:15 enlargements 32:19 entering 20:13 entrance 17:24 58:16 equipped 14:19 14:21	F F 64:2 fact 33:20 fair 33:9,22 34:7 34:9 falls 27:23 familiar 17:6 family 5:20 far 17:23 39:18 45:15 48:6 59:5 favor 51:23 February 5:23 7:8 8:3,18 9:21 10:11 13:12 21:20 33:11,24 34:9 feet 48:8 59:7,7 fender 30:11 31:22 38:15 filing 3:4 finally 9:14 finish 57:4 first 5:13 22:20 32:8,11 43:22 44:25 47:14,16 47:19,23,23 48:2,3 five 35:11 59:7	G gas 59:9 geographic 33:16 geographically 33:18 getting 9:12 girl 40:24 41:11 41:16,25 42:6 42:18 60:6,23 61:6,8 give 18:9 22:15 25:25 26:7,11 60:12 given 14:17 25:17 27:18 28:3,6 64:13

go 4:10 12:8 17:20 45:3,5 52:16 55:8,16 55:24 56:20 60:20 God 40:8 going 5:21 12:3 15:3 17:20 23:11,18 24:10 32:8,23 34:4,19 36:15 46:19 52:7 55:22 59:12 Good 5:3,17,18 great 57:8 green 23:20 44:6 47:8,24 51:20 51:23 57:23 ground 31:19 39:23 40:10,25 41:12,17 42:7 60:7 61:8 guardians 1:5 4:22 guess 15:12	hereinbefore 64:11 hereunto 64:19 highway 26:2,5 hit 38:13 home 12:3,8 26:24 27:2 60:21,22,24 61:4 honest 22:11 honestly 18:24 horn 59:15 hospital 60:16 hour 31:24 59:13 house 6:24 7:25 household 7:17 H&R 36:12,21 37:25	independent 10:13,17 indicating 30:3 individual 29:2 30:5 influence 19:19 26:21,23,25 informed 4:3 inspection 8:25 insurance 25:21 25:23 26:24 27:6 28:20 29:3 intended 12:2 17:12 46:9 intending 12:8 44:2,19 intent 35:15 49:7 interested 64:18 intersection 15:5 15:15 16:8,20 17:7,9,13 30:13 30:20 34:8 37:18 42:23 43:3,6,23 44:10 44:23 48:7 49:18,25 56:6 56:24 57:5 identification 20:2 32:14 33:4 65:5,9 immediately 38:22 44:11 47:9 impact 31:22 impaired 19:22 Imperial 14:14 inaccurate 21:25 22:23 24:8,17 25:14 incapacitated 1:5 4:21 incident 5:22 7:16 8:17 9:7,8 10:22 12:4,10 13:25 14:5,25 18:3,21 19:5,16 21:21 21:22 22:8,20 25:17 28:12 29:14 33:11 41:19 55:14	laying 39:2 left 11:25 16:16 16:22,25 23:17 23:18,19 24:10 24:14,15 30:8,9 30:10,11,25 31:22 35:19,25 35:25 36:19 38:18 44:2,11 44:20,25 45:2,9 45:12,24,25 46:12 47:9,24 48:4,12,21 49:12,13,20 50:2,7 52:12,18 52:19 55:6,7,20 55:22 56:2,21 57:11,17 58:14 58:22 60:4 61:18,20 left-hand 44:22 45:23 57:14 legal 4:7,15 5:9 33:2 let's 26:12 32:7 light 15:17 23:20 38:5 42:19,24 43:2 44:6,14 46:18,23 47:8 47:20,24 50:25 51:13,20 57:24 lights 16:3,5 Lincoln 17:14,20 17:21,24 35:13 36:4 45:3 46:13 58:16 LINE 63:7 lines 45:21 little 59:11 located 11:4 36:12 location 12:12,25 24:2 28:9,15,16 28:22 29:12 33:10,23 35:10 35:21 36:11,22 38:2 51:12	
H	I	identification 20:2 32:14 33:4 65:5,9 immediately 38:22 44:11 47:9 impact 31:22 impaired 19:22 Imperial 14:14 inaccurate 21:25 22:23 24:8,17 25:14 incapacitated 1:5 4:21 incident 5:22 7:16 8:17 9:7,8 10:22 12:4,10 13:25 14:5,25 18:3,21 19:5,16 21:21 21:22 22:8,20 25:17 28:12 29:14 33:11 41:19 55:14	knowledge 9:20 18:25 24:19 25:16,24 29:19 54:3	L
H 5:12,12 65:2 half 10:5 hand 64:20 hands 38:14 happen 10:22 39:13 happened 5:23 8:18 21:2,7 22:4 22:8,16 40:9 hear 30:3 41:14 61:15,16 heard 23:22 30:6 30:12 31:21 35:3 36:2 38:4 38:12,20 39:19 53:14 55:24 59:6,14,18,25 61:17 hearing 38:16 heavy 15:17,19	involved 9:8 involving 21:21	L 5:12,12,12 lady 40:10 laid 38:14 lane 16:22 23:17 36:6,7,7 43:25 44:3,9,11,17,21 44:22 45:12,23 45:25,25 50:23 51:17,18 56:15 lanes 16:9,11,13 16:15 17:3,3,22 35:11,13,16,21 36:4,25 50:18 56:12,17 K	LINE 63:7 lines 45:21 little 59:11 located 11:4 36:12 location 12:12,25 24:2 28:9,15,16 28:22 29:12 33:10,23 35:10 35:21 36:11,22 38:2 51:12	
	J	James 2:7 5:6 JCF 1:8 Jersey 2:9,9 6:14 John 6:18 judicially 1:5 4:21 June 4:5	late 5:20 law 45:18 lawyer 20:16,19	
	K	Kaplen 1:19 2:3,5 4:2,19 5:3,4,16 5:19 9:6,18 20:6		

52:14 long 6:21 10:3 15:11 44:5 look 32:10,16 34:6 50:4 52:18 52:21 53:3 57:11,13 58:5 looked 52:19 53:8 53:9 55:19 58:2 58:6,8 looking 28:10 34:18,19,25 38:2 50:10,14 53:13,24 58:14 58:15 lot 40:13,15 loud 30:6 38:5,7 55:24 lunchtime 11:24 lying 40:12	medication 11:18 11:23 19:20 Medicine 11:19 medium 15:17 mentally 22:9 Merrill 4:15 5:9 Michael 1:9,17 2:5 4:20,23 5:4 5:19 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1,7 64:10 middle 18:2 36:5 39:13 42:16 miles 31:24 59:13 mimic 38:8 mind 22:9 Mintzcoff 11:3 mirrors 54:14 moment 7:16 41:3 49:8 Moore 1:6 4:23 morning 5:3,17 5:18 14:11,13 move 48:7,9,17 48:17 55:25 57:10,18 58:12 moved 48:2,3 moving 17:3 35:11 41:12 47:22 49:5	58:18 59:4,22 59:24 N N2:2 name 5:19 6:19 narrow 46:5 nasty 15:7 near 39:14 need 51:9 never 53:16,17,18 New 1:3,19,20,22 2:4,4,9 4:16,16 4:25 6:14 18:3,6 18:11,12 19:3 22:19 23:3 26:5 26:8 29:8 40:18 41:21 45:12 63:2,4 64:3,5,9 nice 46:14 Niederlander 9:23 10:8,15,19 14:15 night 10:23 22:6 34:6 47:6 60:15 60:24 Ninth 12:13 15:6 15:15 16:8,20 17:16,19,19,23 17:25 23:18,19 23:20 30:14,20 30:23 31:5 33:8 33:23 34:19 35:10,20,20 37:9,18,22 39:3 42:16,24 43:3 43:24 44:10,20 45:2 46:6,25 47:11 48:23 49:19 50:4 51:22 52:2,7,13 53:5,5,22,25 56:9,11,12,22 57:17 noise 38:24 northbound 46:20,24,25	Notary 1:21 5:13 64:8 Note 45:14,20 46:2 55:11 58:10 60:25 NOTED 62:4 Notice 1:18 number 13:17,18 13:19 O oath 3:13 objection 45:14 45:20 46:2 55:11 58:10 60:25 objections 3:7 obligation 52:6,8 observe 36:11 40:11 41:11,24 42:6,17,24 43:10 46:23 61:9,11 observed 41:16 obstructed 30:21 31:3,12,17 54:2 57:5 offhand 27:14 office 29:11 36:12 officer 3:12 21:4 21:6 24:5 officers 29:21 offices 1:19 4:18 oh 40:8 okay 5:25 6:2 25:3 32:12 35:11 51:18 one-family 6:24 open 17:4 operated 10:18 operating 31:9 operation 38:21 operational 15:23 operator 4:15 opinion 55:9,13 opposed 44:21 oral 6:7	Organization 9:23 outcome 64:18 outside 53:21 54:14 overlooking 42:15 owned 7:12 owns 7:13,22 o'clock 11:10
M M 5:12 making 24:9 30:21,22 31:4 35:7,16 36:10 36:19 37:4,8 46:12 52:12 53:2 54:10,18 55:20 56:21 57:14 58:14,22 man 40:2,4,25 42:4,11 61:15 Manhattan 12:14 manner 55:2 manual 8:15,16 mark 28:23 marked 20:3 32:9 33:3 marks 62:2 marriage 64:17 Mary 1:6 4:23 matter 4:20 20:20 36:7 64:18 meals 12:20,21,22 mean 19:9 31:18 55:18				P PARADY 1:6 Pardon 61:13 parentheses 54:22 parked 16:12,14 16:15,21 part 24:20 54:22 partially 56:11 parties 3:4 64:16 party 4:9 pass 17:10 passable 57:9 passed 4:4 patrol 26:2,5 pedestrian 55:10 pedestrians 30:13 30:16 36:11 37:5,9 46:23 47:5 51:22,25 52:6,9,13,24 53:4,25 57:16 57:21 people 31:17 40:13,15 person 1:5,6 4:21 4:22 14:10 53:17 61:12,14

Pg 63:2	Plaintiff 1:18 4:9	proceeding 12:25 43:7 45:3 49:4 55:21	18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1	regular 17:10 related 64:16 relationship 39:4 49:25 56:6
Pgs 63:2	Plaintiffs 1:7 2:3 5:4 20:4	proceedings 4:7 33:2	27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1	remember 12:23 26:18 31:20 32:5 47:7 58:8
Phillips 1:9,17 2:14 4:20,23 6:1 6:20 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1,7 64:10	Plaintiff's 19:25 32:9,13 33:3,19 37:15,20 50:5 50:14 51:15 65:5,8	process 35:7 52:11	33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1,7 64:2,10	reporter 1:21 5:9 64:8
phone 13:9,11,14 13:17,18,19,25 14:4	point 22:14 35:2 50:6 56:2	property 1:6 4:22 provided 29:11 32:20	radio 14:19,21 Raquel 6:20	represent 5:4,20 representing 20:20
photo 9:13 33:5 34:25	police 18:4,7,11 18:13 19:3 21:4 21:5 22:19 23:3 23:12 24:5 25:7 26:6,8 28:3 29:8 29:20 40:17,18 40:18 41:5,7,21 60:11,17	public 1:21 5:13 64:8	reached 17:13 reaching 12:12	reread 21:2
photocopies 9:11	policeman 20:25 26:3	purpose 27:15 purposes 28:10 pursuant 1:18 put 24:11,16 35:4 38:22 50:23 51:4,9,10	reaction 40:8 read 20:23 21:10 21:11,12 23:2,2 23:6,7,8,11,12 23:15 24:5,22 25:3,9 26:4,21	reserved 3:8
photographed 9:4,10	portion 8:21	Q	realized 56:21 rear 46:14	reside 6:13,17 7:2
photographers 28:15	position 36:2	quarters 39:20	reason 14:2 63:9 63:11,13,15,17 63:19,21,23	resided 6:21
photographs 9:7 29:4,5,7,10 32:8 32:11,14,20,24 65:9	Possibly 56:18	question 3:8 19:11 20:9 22:24 26:10 45:6,15,16 46:3	respective 3:4 response 60:8,12 result 8:17	residence 6:15
pickup 8:5	power 8:8,11	present 2:12 22:22	return 41:24 review 54:14 reviewing 20:8 32:15	response 60:8,12
pictures 28:21,23 32:23 34:4 50:11	precautions 54:5 54:8	presume 45:4	revisited 28:9	right 16:17,22
place 4:7,8,12 11:25 14:16 21:19 23:24 55:14	prior 11:23 12:10 12:12 14:24 20:12 38:16	pretty 15:12	recall 18:14,15,17 18:18 20:15 27:11,19 31:20 37:13 46:21 49:23	revisited 28:9
plain 40:17	private 6:15	previously 32:20	recitation 21:19 22:15	right 16:17,22
	privilege 27:24	prior 11:23 12:10	recognize 33:4	right-hand 44:9 44:21
	problem 58:25	12:12 14:24	record 4:2 5:2 23:8 24:23	road 6:14 33:25 39:11 46:15
	proceed 49:12,15 55:7,8	20:12 38:16	red 43:14,16 44:6 reflect 4:3 51:9	regard 38:21 54:6
	proceeded 43:16 44:25 45:4	private 6:15	regard 38:21 54:6	
	48:25 52:16	privilege 27:24		
	55:24 57:18	problem 58:25		
		proceed 49:12,15		
		proceeded 43:16 44:25 45:4		
		48:25 52:16		
		55:24 57:18		

roads 33:14	series 24:25	snowing 15:7,11 33:14 34:5 57:7	27:18,21,23,25 28:21 65:6	striking 55:10
roadway 15:9 32:3 50:4	Services 4:16 5:10	soda 13:7	statements 28:2,4 28:7	Subscribed 62:9
roadways 15:10	set 64:11,20	somebody 27:7	States 1:2 4:24	subsequent 9:16
Robin 6:14	sharp 46:12	someone's 38:14	steering 8:9	substitute 4:8
room 20:13	short 46:6	son 6:18 7:22	stenographer 6:10	substitution 4:6
route 17:12	Shorthand 1:21 64:7	soon 40:15 41:5	step 40:14 41:18	succeeded 9:14
Rumson 6:14	show 20:3,16,21 28:24 32:8 33:3 34:4 36:15,18 41:5	sorry 18:18 19:7 26:2 38:4	STIPULATED 3:2,6,10	Summit 2:8
S	showed 40:17	sound 30:3 35:4 38:4,5,5,6,8,11 38:16,20 39:19	stood 42:14	Sunday 10:23
s 2:2 5:12 32:9 65:2	showing 29:3	shown 28:14 29:4	stop 26:12 43:15 55:23 56:19	supposed 14:11 14:12 45:22
Sabina 1:5 4:4,20 5:20 10:22 29:24	shows 50:18	sounds 41:14	58:20 59:21	sure 54:10,12
safely 54:11	side 16:17 30:7,8 30:9,10 36:24 47:2,2 61:18	southbound 34:20 46:20 47:2	60:2	Susan 2:14 6:18 6:20
safer 46:5,9	sidewalk 41:18	Souther 4:24	stopped 23:23 38:22 43:19	Susan's 6:19
Sarah 2:13 4:15	sign 18:12 21:13 26:14	SOUTHERN 1:3	44:5,8,13,23	swear 5:10
saw 20:13 39:2,23 40:24 42:7 53:16,17,18 58:7 60:6 61:8	signal 43:11,16 47:20 48:19,21 51:23	speak 18:6 29:15 29:21 40:3 42:3	46:17,22 49:5,6	sworn 3:12,14 5:13 62:9 64:12
saying 61:12	signature 21:15 21:16 23:24	speaking 4:15 18:17,18 29:20	49:7 50:24	T
says 54:22	signed 3:11,14 23:3,13 24:2,4 25:10 26:20,24 27:8,9	special 54:5,8	51:13 52:15	T 64:2,2 65:2
scene 25:7 26:13 26:20 28:2 29:14,21 54:21 60:5,20	signing 26:13	speed 31:23 59:12	56:3,7,13,23	take 4:19 8:24
sealing 3:5	Sinus 11:19	spot 35:4 40:19	57:6 58:13 59:5	54:4,9 57:11,13
second 24:9,14 45:2 49:24 50:6 52:15 55:5,15 55:19,22 56:20	sir 8:23 22:13,21 34:24 45:8 53:12	ss 63:3 64:4	stopping 55:15,18 58:25	taken 1:18 4:6,8
seconds 41:6	six 59:7	stagehand 10:2	stops 12:15	4:12 9:15,19
see 23:22 25:3 30:13,16 31:7 31:19 36:13,21 37:9,14 38:17	skid 58:18,22	standing 30:16 36:11 37:5,25	straight 23:19	29:7 33:21 34:4
38:23,25 47:4,5 48:16 52:16 53:3,7,10,21 58:3,4,9 61:18	slacks 42:19	start 4:3 47:22 48:16	24:10,15 45:5	60:16
seeing 55:16	slide 46:15	started 35:25 37:8 48:7,9,17 58:12 59:22,24	47:11,15 54:24	tape 62:2
seen 9:14 20:5,10 29:7,10 42:14 42:15	slip 46:11	State 1:22 63:2 64:3,9	55:3,8,20 58:15	taped 28:6
sent 9:10	slow 54:10	stated 24:11	street 1:19 2:4 4:16 11:5 12:14	tell 5:24 6:12 9:22
	slush 15:10 31:13 31:14,18 39:11	statement 18:10 18:12 20:2	14:25 15:16	22:22 33:7,19
	snow 15:9,16 31:18 54:13,16 54:17 57:3,7	21:18 22:18,24 23:2 24:7,20	16:7,9,16,21	34:7 35:2 44:20
		25:4,10,18,25	18:2,2 23:16	testified 5:14
		26:7,13,14,16	30:14,20,23	testimony 64:13
		26:17,19 27:2,5	31:5 33:8,24	Thank 61:22,24
		27:7,10,12,16	34:22 36:25	theater 11:3 14:14,16,17
			37:16,22 38:2	things 21:24 22:4 22:7 28:24
			39:10,14 42:23	think 32:25 41:9
			43:4,8,23 44:9	thinking 19:22
			45:11,23 46:19	third 36:6
			46:24 47:2,3	three 7:3 31:24 39:20 59:13
			49:19 50:5,15	time 3:9 4:17 10:6 10:21 11:7,11
			51:21	11:22 12:4,7
			strike 29:24	13:2,4,23,24

15:25 20:12	31:4,25 35:8,17	V 2:5	walked 40:24	14:8
21:22 22:22	35:19 36:10,19	van 40:17 41:5,7	walking 31:17	William 1:20 5:14
31:21 33:10	37:4,8 39:18	vehicle 7:6,8,11	47:5 52:20	64:7,23
42:9 47:22 56:2	43:17 44:3,20	7:15,22 8:4,6,8	53:18,21	window 54:15
58:17 59:24	45:9,24 46:5,6	8:19,22,24 9:3,9	want 4:2 32:16,24	windows 54:12
60:4 61:4,25	46:10,12,13,14	9:16 12:5,8,9,24	warm 42:21	windshield 15:20
62:4	47:12,13,15	13:24 30:4	watching 55:6,15	31:8,8 54:15,17
times 19:6,8,9,11	48:23 49:2,13	31:23 32:4 35:3	water 13:7	wiped 54:14,16
today 4:11,17	49:20 50:2,8	43:15,19 46:19	way 19:23 21:25	wipers 15:20 31:8
5:22 13:15 20:5	52:12 53:2	47:10,12,13,16	28:24 30:21	wish 63:5
20:10	54:18 55:20	47:19,23,23	31:4,12,18 33:2	witness 5:10 20:8
told 20:25 21:6,7	56:2,21 57:14	49:24 50:6,24	33:13 39:20	32:15 51:3
top 42:20	58:14,22	52:3 56:3,5,13	41:12 46:9 52:2	64:10,14,19
traffic 17:4 35:11	turned 35:25 44:6	56:19,23 58:13	52:9 53:11 54:2	witnesses 29:15
42:24 43:2,11	47:8,24 51:20	58:17,21,22	55:3 56:9 57:2,5	29:18
45:7,13 46:18	turning 34:23	59:2,5,6,15	57:21 58:23	woman 39:2,22
46:22 50:19,25	35:13 36:25	61:18,19	59:10 64:17	words 40:6
51:20	twelve 11:9	vehicles 7:18,24	wearing 42:18,20	work 10:14,25
transmission 8:15	two 7:24 9:12	16:12,14,16	weather 15:6 31:6	11:7,9 14:11,12
travel 16:9 17:23	12:21 16:10	49:22	33:14,20 46:4,7	14:15 27:23
59:6	17:3,22 23:17	Verizon 13:22	46:8 54:6 57:7	50:2
traveling 14:24	23:19,21 35:11	versus 4:23	went 23:19 24:15	working 10:4,14
16:20 31:23	35:16,21 36:3	Vesey 1:19 2:4	47:11,15 54:23	54:11
37:17,21 42:22	36:25 44:24	vicinity 39:15,16	55:3,20 60:21	wouldn't 46:15
50:16	50:18 54:23	video 4:14 6:10	60:22 61:4	written 18:9 25:2
traverse 56:13	55:3 56:17	Videographer	weren't 22:12	25:18,25 26:11
trial 3:9	type 7:11 8:3	2:13 4:14 5:8	31:11	27:6 28:4
truck 9:8 14:19	11:18	61:25	West 4:16 12:14	wrote 21:7 27:7,8
	U	videos 9:15,19	14:25 15:16	27:9
	umbrella 42:15	videotape 1:17	16:7,9,16,21	
	umbrellas 42:8	4:19	30:14,20,22	X
	understand 5:24	videotaped 6:4	31:4 33:8,23	
	6:3,6 10:9 12:13	view 34:19 36:19	37:16,21 38:2	
	38:11 45:8,13	37:16,20,24	42:22 43:7,23	
	51:19,25 52:5	54:2 57:2,5	44:9 45:23	
	57:16	Visconti 1:20 5:9	46:19,24 47:2,3	
	understanding	5:14 64:7,23	49:19 50:5,15	
	34:3,5 45:22	visibility 30:19	51:21	
	understood 19:2	31:3,11,16	westbound 15:3	
	19:8,12 45:18	56:24 57:8	23:16 37:10	
	57:20		43:8 52:7 53:5	
	United 1:2 4:24	W	wet 15:7,10	
	upset 22:6	wait 48:25	whatsoever 8:21	
	use 13:25 14:4	waiting 30:17	WHEREOF	
		49:9,11 51:22	64:19	
	V	waived 3:5	wide 46:5,14	
		walk 28:10	wife 6:18 7:5,20	
			young 39:2,22	

40:2,3,10,25 42:4,11 61:15	43:8,23 44:9 45:23 46:19,24 47:2,3 49:19 50:5,15 51:21		
0	4		
07 1:8 07306 2:9	4 34:12 37:15 44th 11:5 45th 4:16 11:5		
1	5		
1 32:9 33:3 37:20 50:14 51:15 62:2 1-6 32:13 65:8 10:41 62:4 10:47 61:25 10007 2:4 10037 4:17 19 65:6 1988 8:7	5 34:14 591 2:8		
2	6		
2 6:14 33:19 37:24 20 1:19 2:4 6:22 2007 1:12 4:5,17 5:23 7:9 8:3,18 9:21 21:20 33:24 62:10 64:20 21 1:12 4:17 25 4:16 25th 5:23 8:3,18 9:21 10:11 13:12 21:20 33:11,24 34:9	7 19:25 20:4 65:5 8 88 8:5		
3	9		
3 34:9 36:18 30th 4:5 32 10:5 65:9 36th 18:2 3640 1:8 37th 12:14 14:25 15:16 16:7,9,16 16:21 18:2 23:16 30:14,20 30:22 31:5 33:8 33:23 37:16,22 38:2 42:23 43:3	9:05 11:13,23 13:24 9:20 10:23 9:47 1:13 4:18 908-227-8932 13:20		